#### MINUTES OF THE 92<sup>ND</sup> MEETING OF THE HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE HELD ON MONDAY, NOVEMBER 9, 2020.

#### A. Proposals:

## Item No. 1: Add./alts. In residential building at plot no. 1513 to 1518, main Road, Nai Sarak, Chandni Chowk, Delhi.

- **1.** The proposal was forwarded by the North DMC (online) for consideration of the Heritage Conservation Committee (HCC). Earlier, the HCC did not approve the proposal at its meeting held on August 14, 2019, specific observations were made:
  - "1. The proposal was forwarded by the North DMC (online) for consideration of the HCC. The proposal is in Grade-III of heritage notified list of MCD area.
  - 1. The HCC observed that representatives from MCD are not attending to the HCC meetings and presenting their comments/ views on the proposal received from the MCD areas. The representation from MCD in the forthcoming meeting of the HCC be ensured; otherwise, the cases received from the MCD would be returned without consideration by the HCC.
  - 2. During the analysis of the proposal, it observed that the concerned local body, North DMC in this case has not given comments, on the structural stability of the existing structure and the heritage architectural character etc. On further analysis, it observed that a lot of existing elements have architectural heritage value.
  - 3. It was decided that before forwarding the proposal to HCC for consideration, MCD should ensure detailed comments on the proposal for its structural stability and architectural heritage. Otherwise, the cases would be returned without consideration by the HCC.
  - 4. Given the above, the proposal was analyzed and found not acceptable and not approved with the following observations:
    - i. From the existing photographs of the proposal submitted, it observed that the existing structure is in a dilapidated condition. Detailed comments from the local body on the structural stability along with the existing heritage character of the structure is required to be submitted.
    - ii. Detailed photographs of every nook and corner of the heritage building depicting the heritage character be submitted.
    - iii. The drawings showing existing & proposed changes should be superimposed to highlight the proposed modifications. A sufficient number of Self-explanatory 3D views (of the actual surroundings/environment) clearly showing the proposed design scheme superimposed on existing with proper annotations and corresponding to proposal drawings be submitted.
    - iv. An appropriate number of photographs from all sides of the building should also be submitted to study the overall heritage character of the vicinity. Efforts should be made to retain and conserve the existing architectural heritage character of the structure and elevations are designed accordingly, and the same shall be incorporated in the design and 3-D views.
    - v. All heritage conservation laws should be respected during the conservation process.
    - vi. It should also be clarified that what efforts are being made to match it to the heritage environment in the vicinity.

Minutes of the  $92^{nd}$  meeting of the Heritage Conservation Committee held on Monday, November 9, 2020.

- vii. The local body should ensure the regulations as applicable under Unified Building Bye-laws for Delhi 2016, and Master Plan of Delhi be strictly adhered to.
- viii. Care should be taken to handle all contingencies during the restoration process, including handling of building materials in such a manner so that the surrounding area is not disturbed.
- ix. The structural safety of the building and buildings in the vicinity should be ensured.
- x. No changes/projections are permitted on the external side/facade, which should be retained as per the original design.
- xi. A detailed conservation report is required to be submitted, to evaluate and analyze the impact on the proposal, and mechanism and processes are likely to be adopted to conserve the architectural heritage of the heritage building.
- 5. Therefore, in the absence of detailed comments received from the concerned local body (North DMC) concerning the proposal on various aspects like structural stability and architectural heritage etc., it is returned to North MCD with the request to furnish their detailed comments along with the revised proposal for the consideration of the HCC."
- **2.** The revised proposal received (online) was scrutinized and found acceptable, following observations were made:
  - a. All heritage conservation laws should be respected during the conservation process.
  - b. The local body should ensure the regulations as applicable under Unified Building Bye-laws for Delhi 2016, and Master Plan of Delhi be strictly adhered to.
  - c. Care should be taken to handle all contingencies during the restoration process, including handling of building materials in such a manner so that the surrounding area is not disturbed.
  - d. The structural safety of the building and buildings in the vicinity should be ensured.
  - e. No changes/projections are permitted on the external side/facade, which should be retained as per the original design.

## Item No. 2: Plans in respect of Repair/renovation at premises no. 9A, Third floor, Middle Circle, Connaught Place, New Delhi.

- **1.** The proposal was forwarded by the NDMC (online) for consideration of the HCC. Earlier, the Heritage Conservation Committee (HCC) did not approve the proposal at its meeting held on June 23, 2020, specific observations were made:
  - "1. The proposal forwarded by the NDMC (Online) for consideration of the HCC was deferred by the HCC at its meeting held on June 8, 2020.

Minutes of the  $92^{nd}$  meeting of the Heritage Conservation Committee held on Monday, November 9, 2020.

- 1. The proposal forwarded by the NDMC (online) was scrutinized. It included the work in terms of plastering/cladding and patch repairs, flooring and reflooring, whitewashing, painting etc. including erection of false ceiling, erection or re-erection of internal partitions, replacing of old sanitary fixtures in toilets, replacement of electrical wiring and fitting, replacement of old sanitary pipes, opening and closing windows, ventilators and doors opening within the owner's plot, repair of fallen bricks, stones, pillars, beams etc. reflooring in front of lift at ground floor and third floor, exposed electrical wires, telephone cables etc. to be arranged at ground floor (middle circle) painting of exterior façade of the building.
- 2. The proposal was scrutinized and found not acceptable, and the following observations were made:
  - i. Discrepancies have been observed viz-a-viz work details submitted as per Para 2 above and the drawings/photographs provided. Appropriate number of existing site pictures be provided to understand the existing site conditions (in correlation to the works indicated in para 2 above) with proper uncut views from all sides, including external façade.
  - ii. From photographs, it was visibly observed that most of the repair works, in terms of Para 2 above, have already been completed. The concerned local body (NDMC) should ensure that the works shall commence only after approval from HCC.
  - iii. The quality of 3D views should improve; the current 3D views do not explicate the design scheme adequately.
  - iv. NDMC shall ensure that the placement, size, colour, text etc. of the signages/signboards etc. shall be as per their approved policy/guidelines for Connaught place area.
  - v. NDMC shall also ensure that the proposal completed in all respect be forwarded for the consideration of HCC. Overall, it was suggested to comply with the above observations of the HCC and re-submit revised proposal after incorporating the suggestions of the HCC."
- **2.** The revised proposal received (online) was scrutinized and found acceptable, following observations were made:
  - i. No changes/projections are permitted on the external side/facade, which should be retained as per the original design.
  - ii. The structural safety of the buildings should be ensured. Heritage Character comprising of architectural elements such as arches, cornices, quoins, gables, architraves, Palladian-style windows etc., if any, should be retained in the modifications.
  - iii. It was suggested to use the energy-saving fittings and fixtures for all electrical appliances and sanitary fittings.
  - iv. NDMC shall ensure that the placement, size, colour, text etc. of the signages/signboards etc. to be as per approved policy/guidelines prepared by NDMC for the Connaught place area.

Minutes of the  $92^{nd}$  meeting of the Heritage Conservation Committee held on Monday, November 9, 2020.

# Additional Item No. 1: Ownership issues related to the Additions/Alterations/Repairs & Renovations proposal received by the Heritage Conservation Committee from the local bodies

- 1. It was observed by the HCC that proposals for additions/alterations/repairs & renovations to heritage buildings are being received directly from the tenants, though, the maintenance of heritage buildings is the responsibility of the owner in terms of Annexure II of the Unified Building Byelaws for Delhi 2016.
- 2. In one such case viz. proposal relating to repair and renovation to 5, Scindia House, Connaught Place, New Delhi, the proposal that was received from the tenant was challenged by the owner in the Delhi High Court and the HCC was also made a party to the case though aspect relating to ownership does not fall within the purview of the HCC.
- 3. To avoid HCC getting involved in litigation, it was decided to ask the local bodies to ensure that only those proposals for additions/alterations/repairs & renovations are sent to HCC where there are no disputes regarding ownership of buildings or tenant-owner disputes.

sd/- sd/-

(Kamran Rizvi)
Chairman, HCC
Additional Secretary (D & UT),
Ministry of Housing & Urban Affairs,
Government of India

(Ruby Kaushal)
Member-Secretary
Heritage Conservation Committee